

Should Britain Leave the EU?

Dedicated to the memory of Sir Julian Hodge (1904–2004)

Should Britain Leave the EU?

An Economic Analysis of a Troubled
Relationship

Patrick Minford

Professor of Economics, Cardiff Business School,
Cardiff University, UK

Vidya Mahambare

Research Associate, Cardiff Business School,
Cardiff University, UK

Eric Nowell

Research Associate, Cardiff Business School,
Cardiff University, UK and Honorary Fellow,
Liverpool University Management School,
Liverpool University, UK

Edward Elgar in association with the
Institute of Economic Affairs

Edward Elgar

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

iv

Copyright page — to be set by publisher

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	vi
<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>Author Biographies</i>	xi
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
PART 1 COSTS AND BENEFITS OF UK MEMBERSHIP OF THE EU – A POLICY ANALYSIS	
1 Introduction, Summary and Conclusions: Why the UK should Renegotiate or Leave the EU	3
2 Evaluating European Trading Arrangements	22
3 Other Issues: Currency, Regulation and Public Finance	37
PART 2 BACKGROUND ANALYSIS OF TRADE	
4 Agriculture	61
5 Manufacturing	90
6 Services	127
7 Evaluating the Costs and Benefits of EU Trade Arrangements	172
PART 3 OVERALL CONCLUSIONS OF THE ANALYSIS	
8 Last Thoughts: What is to be done?	217
<i>Bibliography</i>	227
<i>Index</i>	243

List of Figures

2.1	A customs union tariff on a commodity	23
2.2	The CAP in outline	28
3.1	Euro-dollar exchange rate	40
3.2	Pensions contributions and payments (% of GDP)	46
4.1	EU agriculture: basic statistics for 2001	63
4.2	UK imports and exports of agricultural goods	66
5.1	Manufacturing value added	91
5.2	State aid to the manufacturing sector	111
6.1	Comparative evolution of intra-EU trade and FDI in services, 1992–2000	133
6.2	Value of world trade in services by mode (%) in 2001 . .	134
6.3	UK trade balance in services, 2002	137
6.4	Productivity growth by sector and sectoral share of GDP in the US and the EU in 1995–2000	145
6.5	Labour productivity growth in ICT/non-ICT service sectors	146
6.6	Services: the current situation	149
6.7	EU single market partial deregulation without common external barrier	150
6.8	EU customs union	150

List of Tables

1.1	Effects of EU manufacturing trade barriers on prices – deviation from the US price (%)	8
1.2	Estimates of tariff-equivalents on manufactured goods due to all trade barriers (%)	9
1.3	Survey indicators of service barriers	9
1.4	A conspectus of costs	14
3.1	The welfare losses (political cost) produced by EMU compared with floating	39
3.2	Indicators of tax and regulation	42
3.3	Degrees of harmonisation and their long-run effects on output and unemployment	44
3.4	Projected deficits 2050 (% of GDP)	47
3.A.1	Range of estimates for current direct net cost (% of GDP)	52
4.1	Basic agricultural statistics for the EU, 2001	65
4.2	Average price of a food basket	68
4.3	International comparisons of government policies aimed at protecting agriculture	70
4.4	US–EU farm total support estimate	73
4.5	Producer and consumer support estimates of support to agriculture (PSE, CSE)	75
4.6	Member states’ contributions to and benefits from the EU, 2000	76
4.7	Welfare gains due to reduction in worldwide barriers in agricultural trade	82
4.8	Estimates of welfare costs of the CAP to the EU (studies between 1980 and 2000)	84

4.9	Estimates of welfare costs of the CAP to the EU (studies in 2000s)	85
5.1	Merchandise export expansion by region and level of technology, 1980–2000	93
5.2	Merchandise import expansion by region and level of technology, 1980–2000	94
5.3	US goods exports	95
5.4	US goods exports to selected countries/regions	96
5.5	Total US imports (BOP basis)	96
5.6	US goods imports from selected countries/regions	97
5.7	Imports and tariff peaks, 1999	98
5.8	MFN tariff peaks in manufactures, by technology-based product groups, 2000	102
5.9	Frequency of core NTBs of selected countries	103
5.10	Duty level of AD orders imposed by the European Union	105
5.11	AD sectoral distribution of initiations	106
5.12	AD sectoral distribution of measures	106
5.13	EU Anti-dumping tariffs on Taiwanese companies	108
5.14	EU Anti-dumping duties against Japanese consumer electronics and office machinery imports	108
5.15	Anti-Dumping sectoral distribution of initiations and measures, 1995–2003	109
5.16	Seizures of counterfeit and pirated goods in EU Member States, 1999–2000	116
5.17	Percentage deviation from the US price	117
5.18	ACNielsen survey: price comparison	118
5.19	Prices relative to the lowest price in the sample	119
5.20	Fragmentation indices	119
5.21	Protection estimates: ratio of domestic to world price (1993)	121
5.22	Potential benefits at regional level	123
5.23	Gains from removal of protection	125
6.1	Share of services in total value added at current prices and employment (%)	129
6.2	Ratio of average earnings in each sector to average earnings in manufacturing	131

6.3	World trade in services by modes of supply (billion US\$)	134
6.4	Estimated patterns of world and OECD trade in services, % of total world exports, 2000	136
6.5	Ad valorem tariff equivalent for the EU and the US	154
6.6	Progress of regulatory reforms in OECD countries	156
6.7	Global welfare gains from services liberalisation	157
6.8	Estimated tariff-equivalents in trade services gravity model-based regression method	158
6.9	Brief summary of CGE studies that model the EU as a separate economy	164
6.10	Estimated welfare effects of liberalising selected services in the EU	166
6.A.1	regulatory and market environment in 1998	168
6.A.2	Restrictiveness index scores	169
6.A.3	Average gross operating margins of services firms, 1994–96	170
6.A.4	Price and cost effect measures	171
7.1	Gain/loss (% cent of GDP) from the EU going to a customs union in services with 15% common tariff	181
7.2	Net gains to the UK and to the REU if the UK withdraws from status quo trade arrangements and adopts unilateral free trade (% of GDP)	181
7.3	Net gains to the UK and to the REU if the EU replaces status quo trade arrangements with unilateral free trade (% of GDP)	182
7.A.1	UK alone liberalises	186
7.A.2	All sectors liberalised together ('Exercise 1' in Appendix B)	187
7.A.3	EU as a whole liberalises	187
7.A.4	All sectors liberalised together ('Exercise 2' in Appendix B)	188
7.B.1	Effects on UK of 1% tariffs in UK	192
7.B.2	Effects on rest of European Union of 1% tariffs in UK	193
7.B.3	Effects on NAFTA of 1% tariffs in UK	194
7.B.4	Effects on rest of world of 1% tariffs in UK	195
7.B.5	Effects on UK of 1% tariffs in UK and rest of EU	196
7.B.6	Effects on rest of the European Union of 1% tariffs in UK and rest of EU	197

7.B.7	Effects on NAFTA of 1% tariffs in UK and rest of EU	198
7.B.8	Effects on rest of the world of 1% tariffs in UK and rest of EU	199
7.B.9	Effect on UK of removal of trade barriers	200
7.B.10	Effect on rest of European Union of removal of trade barriers	201
7.B.11	Effect on NAFTA of removal of trade barriers	202
7.B.12	Effect on rest of world of removal of trade barriers . .	203
7.C.1	Welfare gains from Table 7.B.9	208

Author Biographies

Patrick Minford is professor of economics at Cardiff Business School, Cardiff University, where he has been since October 1997. Between 1967 and 1976 he held economic positions in the Ministry of Finance, Malawi; Directors' staff, Courtaulds Limited; H M Treasury; H M Treasury's Delegation to Washington, DC; Manchester University; and The National Institute for Economic and Social Research. From 1976 to 1997 he was professor of economics at the University of Liverpool. He was a member of the Monopolies and Mergers Commission from 1990 to 1996; and one of H M Treasury's Panel of Forecasters ('6 Wise Men') from January 1993 until December 1996. He was awarded the C.B.E. for services to economics in 1996. He has published books, articles and journalism on exchange rates, unemployment, housing, trade and macroeconomics. He founded and directs the Liverpool Research Group in Macroeconomics, which has published forecasts based on the Liverpool Model of the UK since 1979; the group is now very largely based within the Julian Hodge Institute of Applied Macroeconomics at Cardiff Business School.

Vidya Mahambare holds a BA in economics from the University of Bombay, and masters degrees in economics from Gokhale Institute of Politics and Economics and in International Trade and Finance from Lancaster University, where she later also obtained a doctorate in international economics. Her main areas of research and publication are in the economics of liberalisation and corporate finance issues in developing countries. She is a research associate at Cardiff Business School, Cardiff University.

Eric Nowell obtained his BA in Physics and his M.Sc. in Applied Statistics and Random Processes from U.M.I.S.T; and later an M.Sc. in Audiology from the University of Salford. He has worked as a researcher in applied medicine, in plasma physics, in computer-

aided design engineering and in diesel combustion processes. Since October 1983 he has worked with Patrick Minford in developing economic models. He is based in the Management School of the University of Liverpool, where he is an honorary research fellow.

Preface

Europe – that is, the EEC or Common Market at first, most recently to become the European Union – has been a major issue of British political discussion since the Second World War, and since UK accession to the EEC in 1973 it has become arguably the dominant issue. For the first two decades of membership the basic assumption of most British politicians was that it was overall a good thing, even if particular elements in it (such as notoriously the Common Agricultural Policy) gave trouble. In the last decade, as the Franco-German programme for European integration has been pushed forward relentlessly, that basic assumption has come to be widely questioned. That questioning and with it the awareness of the difficulties created by membership was intensified by the debate over whether Britain should join the euro; though that debate was narrowly confined to the effects of euro membership, and for practical purposes took for granted that EU membership itself was beneficial, the arguments over the euro inevitably overlapped with wider issues – for example, those of harmonisation and budgetary discipline (especially pensions). In this book my co-authors and I have reviewed earlier work on the euro, harmonisation and budgetary issues, much of it by now familiar to informed British readers; but our main focus has been on trade, where the assumption of net benefit has been barely questioned and little serious work has taken place. That is the reason why, even though many of the worst problems for Britain in its European relationships lie in the areas of harmonisation, budgets and monetary affairs including the euro, the preponderance of material in this book is on trade. It has been startling to us to discover, as we worked on it, how little we or others have previously known or understood about this murky and complex area.

This book would not have been possible without the moral and

financial support provided by Sir Julian Hodge, who died a few months ago in his hundredth year and to whose memory it is most warmly dedicated. With his support Cardiff University, its Business School and I set up the Julian Hodge Institute of Applied Macroeconomics in 1998; one of its key objectives was to examine the economics of Britain's relationship with the rest of Europe. Earlier work within the Institute covered the euro, harmonisation and budgetary issues; this latest book extends it to include trade. I am also grateful to Jonathan Hodge, Sir Julian's son, and to Eric Hammonds, for a long time chairman of the Julian Hodge Bank, for their enthusiastic and robust personal support of the Institute's efforts.

Edward Elgar and his staff, who are publishing this book in association with the IEA, have shown their usual efficiency and goodwill in seeing this project through. Bruce Webb typeset the book in L^AT_EX to his usual high standards. He and David Meenagh at the Institute also kindly assisted us with the tables, figures and also the simulations of the Liverpool Model. My co-authors and I are grateful to them all.

Patrick Minford
February 2005

List of Abbreviations

ABARE	Australian Bureau of Agriculture and Research Economics
AD	Anti-dumping
AFTA	ASEAN Free Trade Area
ALM	Active labour market measures
AMS	Aggregate measure of support
ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
AVE	Ad valorem equivalent
BOP	Balance of Payments
CAP	Common Agricultural Policy
CEEC	Central and Eastern European Countries
CGE	Computational general equilibrium
CITAC	Consuming Industries Trade Action Coalition
CMO	Common Market Organisation
CSE	Consumer subsidy equivalent
CV	Countervailing
DEFRA	Department for the Environment, Farming and Rural Affairs
EC	European Commission
EEP	Export enhancement programme
EFTA	European Free Trade Area
EIU	Economist Intelligence Unit
EMU	European Monetary Union EU European Union
FATS	Foreign Affiliates Trade in Services
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FOB	Free-on-Board
FSA	Financial Services Agreement
FSAP	Financial Services Action Plan
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GDP	Gross domestic product
GE	General equilibrium
GMO	Genetically modified organism
GTAP	Global trade analysis project
ICT	Information and communication technologies
IMF	International Monetary Fund
M&A	Mergers and acquisitions
MPA	Multi-Fibre Agreement
MFN	Most favoured nation
MMPT	Michigan Model of World Production and Trade
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Area
NATO	North American Treaty Organisation
NIESR	National Institute of Economic and Social Research
NTB	Non-tariff barrier
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PPP	Purchasing power parity
PSE	Producer support estimate
QR	Quantitative restrictions
REU	Rest of the European Union
ROW	Rest of the world
SMP	Single Market Action Plan
SMPS	Single Market Programme in Services
SPS	Sanitary and phytosanitary standards
SSG	Special safeguard regime (WTO)
TMNP	Temporary movement of natural persons
TRIPS	Trade Related Aspects of International Property Rights
TRQ	Tariff-rate quota
TSE	Total support estimate
TUPE	Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Unemployment) Regulations
UN	United Nations
USITC	United States International Trade Commission
VER	Voluntary export restraint
WTO	World Trade Organisation